Influence of Consumer Dissatisfaction and Need For Variation on Interest in Brand Switching of XL Internet Service Users

Muhammad Fayyadh*, Baiq Handayani Rinuastuti, Dwi Buana Sakti

1University of Mataram

Corresponding author. Email <u>basiyr43@gmail.com</u>

ABSTRACT

This study aims to determine the effect of consumer dissatisfaction and need for variation on interest in brand switching of XL INTERNET SERVICE USERS. The type of research conducted is descriptive quantitative, which is causal associative. The population in this study were consumers of XL Internet Service Providers. The number of samples taken was 100 people. The sampling technique used in this study was purposive sampling technique. The data was collected through an online survey and analyzed using multiple linear regression analysis through the SPSS version 25 program. The results of this study indicate that consumer dissatisfaction and variety seeking have a positive and significant influence on brand switching interest among XL Internet service users.

Keywords: Dissatisfaction, Variety Seeking, Brand Switching Interest

1. INTRODUCTION

Developments in the world of unrestricted trade lead to higher and fiercer competition, which requires companies to be more creative in their business activities. Currently, the number of brands and products competing in the market is very large, so consumers have a variety of choices and alternatives for products or services that can meet their needs. In this situation, companies are required to be more responsive to consumers' needs.

Internet has become one of the basic daily needs for some Indonesians, especially in urban areas. Coupled with the development of technology, almost all of which require the Internet. From communicating using social media, searching for information, to work or education needs. Based on data from the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), Indonesian Internet Service Provider users reached 243.63 million in 2020. The number of users is equivalent to 89.07 per 100 population. This means that the number of internet service users in the country reached 89 out of 100 population. (Kusnandar, 2022)

According to the We Are Social report, the number of internet users in Indonesia has reached 213 million people as of January 2023. This number represents 77% of Indonesia's total population of 276.4 million people at the beginning of this year. The number of internet users in the country increased by 5.44% year-on-year. In January 2022, the number of internet users in Indonesia was only 202 million people. According to the trend, the number of internet users in

Indonesia has been increasing every year in the last decade. The number of internet users in the country was recorded to have increased by 142.5 million from January 2013, which was only 70.5 million people. The highest growth in the number of internet users in the last decade was in January 2016, when it reached 50.16% on an annual basis (yoy). While the slowest growth was in January 2022, which grew only 0.5% (yoy). The report also found that the average Indonesian uses the internet for 7 hours and 42 minutes per day. On the other hand, the report noted that the majority or 98.3% of Indonesian internet users use mobile phones. (Annur, 2023)

Internet service providers are divided into two, mobile broadband and fixed broadband. Both have a number of fundamental differences, although they are often considered the same. Mobile broadband, as the name implies, is an Internet service that comes from a cellular network via a SIM card. Fixed broadband, on the other hand, is a wired Internet service based on fiber-optic networks (Luky, 2023).

The number of SIM-based Internet Service Provider brands allows customers to choose the best brand for them. XL Axiata Tbk itself has several brands such as XL Axiata, Axis, XL Priority and recently Live on. Other companies also have many brands such as Telkomsel, By U, IM3, Indosat and many others. Not only can customers choose, they can also switch brands. Brand switching itself can occur due to various factors of the brand that are less than satisfactory.

Brand switching occurs when a consumer or a group of consumers switch their loyalty from one brand to another. Brand switching means moving from one product to another.

Peter & Olson (2013) argue that brand switching is a buying pattern characterized by a change or shift from one brand to another. Brand switching occurs because there are many product variations, and customers' brand switching behavior is a complex phenomenon influenced by behavioral factors, competition, and time. This theory suggests that brand switching can be influenced by several factors. Poor customer experiences can cause customers to switch from the brands they originally used to new brands (Peter & Olson, 2013).

Customer dissatisfaction is one of the factors that cause brand switching. Internet service providers must be able to provide a satisfying experience to get repeat customers. The free competition that occurs can lead customers to use different products. According to Kotler & Keller (2009), dissatisfaction is a situation where consumers' expectations

are not the same or higher than the performance they receive from marketers, thus causing the behavior of choosing products according to their needs, if needs are not met, consumers may switch to another brand. At this time, consumers have much higher and more diverse demands. If these demands cannot be met, consumers will look for better alternatives that can meet these demands (Kotler & Keller, 2009).

The number of complaints experienced by many XL Axiata customers has left many XL customers feeling unsatisfied. XL Axiata and Axis networks reported outages on Thursday (7/7/2022). A number of XL and Axis users reported signal loss and no service, leaving them unable to use the services of both mobile operators. There were at least

303 reports from a range of users, of which 69 percent complained of signal loss, 27 percent reported difficulty accessing the Internet network and 4 percent had difficulty accessing email. The reports came from multiple users in multiple regions of Indonesia (Pratama & Pratomo, n.d.). This is often the case with XL and Axis services. Complaints, most of which are service issues, are one of the reasons why many XL customers feel dissatisfied.

Customer satisfaction is closely linked to customer loyalty. Wijayanti (inDwinanto & Suasana, 2018) says that customers who are satisfied and loyal to a brand have a lower tendency to switch. Loyalty is closely related to brand loyalty or the opposite of brand switching intention, but customers who are satisfied with a particular product arenot necessarily loyal to that brand. There is a need to analyze why someone might switch brands, especially as increasing competition causes Internet Service Providers to try different strategies to offer alternatives or other variations that are expected to benefit consumers. Switching between brands is common with Internet Service Provider cards. With the rapid development of globalization and information, a connection that can run smoothly and quickly is needed. This is what makes Internet service provider companies compete to develop their products to be the best by following the development of changing their network from 4.5 to 5G.

Seeking variety is one of the factors that cause brand switching. The number of Internet service providers causes consumers to choose a better service provider. Having so many service providers causes each service provider to develop its products, which is competition among service providers. This competition leads to superior products and causes consumers to seek variety.

According to a survey by the Indonesian Association of Internet Service Providers (APJII), Telkomsel was the most widely used mobile operator in the country in early 2023. Of the 8,510 people surveyed, 40.27% use Telkomsel, Simpati, Halo Card or byU mobile operators. Meanwhile, 33.4% use Indosat Ooredoo Hutchison or Three; 21% use XL Axiata or Axis; and 5.32% use Smartfren. The majority of respondents (47.5%) chose a mobile operator based on the availability of the strongest signal in their area. There were also those who chose a particular operator because of the price of Internet packages and attractive promotions (26.8%), the old number they used (18.4%), the ease of purchasing data packages (6.5%), and other reasons (0.8%). In early 2023, most respondents (42.2%) spent between Rp10,000 and Rp50,000 per month on mobile internet, and the majority (49.2%) felt that the cost of mobile internet connection was becoming more expensive. APJII conducted this survey among 8,510 respondents spread across 38 Indonesian provinces, from Aceh to the Papua mountains. The survey was conducted from January 10 to January 27, 2023, using a multi-stage random sampling technique and questionnaire interviews. The data has a margin of error of 1.14% at the 95% confidence level. (Ahdiat, 2023).

With so many choices and needs to satisfy, consumers will continue to search for things that meet their needs. Consumers will look for brand variations that meet their needs and desires. Internet service providers will develop their products to meet the needs of consumers.

XL Axiata Tbk is one of the companies that develops its products to be the best. One of its products is XL Axiata. In this development, there are many obstacles that cause their products to experience many problems. Frequent interruptions of PT XL Axiata Tbk's products are one of the big problems for the company and also for the Internet service users. This is also supported by the desire to find new variations. Not only because of dissatisfaction, the desire

to look for variations can also occur because the person himself wants to have new experiences, this can also trigger brand switching in Internet service provider products.

Based on the description of the background, the indication of brand switching interest in XL Axiata Internet Service Provider products is certainly one of the problems that the company really needs to pay attention to. Therefore, it is necessary to analyze the factors that can cause brand switching interest in XL Axiata Internet Service Provider products. The phenomenon shows that there is a tendency for XL users to switch to other Internet Service Providers, besides there is dissatisfaction and willingness to look for variations among XL consumers. Therefore, it is necessary to prove whether dissatisfaction seeking and variety seeking have an effect on brand switching interest.

2. RESEARCH METHODS

This research is a type of quantitative research with a causal associative approach. This study aims to determine the value of the influence of the dissatisfaction variable (X1) and the influence of the variable seeking variety (X2) on brand switching interest (Y). The location of this research was conducted in the city of Mataram, where the object of this research was the people of the city of Mataram, West Nusa Tenggara. The reason for choosing this location is because there is a research phenomenon that is believed to be related to brand switching interest. Mataram City is also one of the cities that has a high level of competition for Internet service providers. The population in this study were consumers of XL Internet Service Providers. In this study, the data collection method used was a sample survey by distributing questionnaires to the respondents.

In this study, there were 9 indicators, which means that the number of samples taken was $9 \times 10 = 90$ samples. Therefore, the researchers in this study took a sample of 90 and rounded up to 100 samples, which were used as samples respondents. The characteristics of the respondents used in this study are as follows:

- a. Consumers over the age of 17
- b. Consumers who choose to use XL Internet Service Providers.
- c. XL user consumers who are interested in using other service providers.
- d. Questionnaire is a data collection technique that is done by giving a set of questions or written statements for respondents to answer (Sugiyono, 2017). The statement is made in the form of a questionnaire using a scale from 1 to 5, each of which represents the opinion of the respondent. 5. To find out the number of intervals and the size of the class interval can be found by the following formula

Description:

$$I = \frac{R}{K} = \frac{4}{5} = 0.8$$

I = Size of Class Interval

R = Range (Class)

K = Number of Class Intervals

Based on the results of the above calculations, the researchers grouped the responses of each respondent to each indicator of the research variable as in the following table 1 :

Table 1 Class Intervals and Respondent Answer Categories

Interval	Dissatisfaction	Seeking Variety	Interest in Switching Brands
4,21 - 5,00	Very High	Very High	Very High
3,41 - 4,20	High	High	High
2,61 - 3,40	High enough	High enough	High enough
1,81 - 2,60	Not High	Not High	Not High
1,00 - 1,80	Very Not High	Very Not High	Very Not High

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

3.1. Multiple Linear Regression Analysis

3.1.1. Influence of Dissatisfaction variable on Brand Switching Interest

The results of testing dissatisfaction with brand switching interest obtained a significant value of 0.000 < 0.05, and the tcount value in Table 4.12 is 6.031 > 1.984723. This shows that there is a positive and significant influence between dissatisfaction variable and brand switching interest in XL Internet service providers. Based on the test results, it can be concluded that the hypothesis that dissatisfaction affects brand switching interest can be accepted.

3.1.2. The effect of the variable Needs to Seek Variety on Interest in Switching Brands

The test results of the need to seek variety on brand switching interest obtained a significant value of 0.000 < 0.05 and the tcount value in Table 4.12 is 5.190 > 1.984723. This shows that there is a positive and significant influence between the variable need to seek variety on brand switching interest in XL Internet service providers. Based on the test results, it can be concluded that the hypothesis that the need to seek variety affects brand switching interest can be accepted.

3.2. Coefficient of Determination (R2) and Adjusted R2

The coefficient of determination (R2) is used to determine the ability of the independent variable (dissatisfaction and need to seek variation) to explain the dependent variable (interest in switching brands). The results of the coefficient of determination (R2) test can be seen in the Model Summary output from the results of the multiple linear regression analysis as follows:

- a. Based on the calculations, the coefficient of determination (R2) is 0.673 or 67.3%.
- b. This means that the ability of the independent variable to explain the dependent variable is 0.673 or 67.3% and the remaining 32.7% cannot be explained by the independent variable or can be explained by variables outside the independent variable. This result can be classified as a moderate R Square.
- c. Based on the calculations in Table 4.13, we can see that the adjusted R value2 is 0.666 or 66.6%. This means that the ability to explain the independent variable on the dependent variable is 0.666 or 66.6%.

4. DISCUSSIN

Based on the results of the research conducted on the variables included in this study, some of the results can be explained as follows:

4.1. The Effect of Dissatisfaction on Brand Switching Interest

Customer dissatisfaction can be defined as a response to the evaluation of perceived or confirmed discrepancies between prior expectations and the actual performance of the product felt after use. Customer dissatisfaction occurs when consumers use and feel certain products that have been advertised or marketed, but what they imagine does not match what actually happens.

Dissatisfaction can cause many bad things for the company. Dissatisfaction can lead to decreased customer loyalty, poor company image, decreased business profits, decreased trust, and decreased interest in switching brands.

The results showed that dissatisfaction has a positive and significant impact on brand switching interest. This is evidenced by the dissatisfaction variable with a significant value of 0.000 < 0.05 and a calculated t-value of 6.031 > 1.984. These results indicate that there is a positive and significant influence between the dissatisfaction variable on the brand switching interest variable, or the higher the consumer dissatisfaction, the higher the interest in brand switching among XL Internet service users. It can be concluded that hypothesis one can be accepted, which means that dissatisfaction has a positive and significant effect on the brand switching interest of XL internet service users. This means that the higher the consumer's dissatisfaction, the higher the consumer's brand switching interest. Conversely, when consumer dissatisfaction is low, consumer brand switching interest will decrease.

This shows that the three indicators of dissatisfaction, namely the existence of perceived complaints, discrepancies in quality with expectations, consumers' evaluations of their decisions, can influence brand switching interest. Based on the results of this study, the average dissatisfaction of XL Internet service users is in the high category. The indicator of dissatisfaction that has the highest value is the existence of complaints felt by consumers when using XL Internet services, this consumer dissatisfaction arises because many consumers feel that XL Internet services often experience interruptions, slow and unstable Internet, XL Internet services also have problems in features that do not provide many benefits. Followed by an indicator of discrepancy between quality and expectations, this occurs because of the high

expectations that consumers have of XL Internet service providers. The last indicator is an indicator of consumers' judgment of their decisions, which has the same high results as other indicators. This result is obtained because many consumers think that the choice they made was not the right one. This shows that dissatisfaction arises because consumers feel a complaint, which is a splice or bad thing that consumers feel when using a product . When consumers use a product that does not meet their expectations, they will feel dissatisfied and this can influence consumers' brand switching decisions.

Dissatisfaction can certainly affect brand switching interest, although it is not the only factor that shapes brand switching interest. The results of this study are consistent with the research conducted by Wardhaniika & Hendrati (2021), whose research results show that dissatisfaction has a positive and significant effect on brand switching. This statement is also supported by research conducted by Klaudea & Rohman (2022), which shows that dissatisfaction has a positive and significant effect on consumers' brand switching interest. From the above research references, it can be concluded that when consumers feel dissatisfied when using a product, the decision to switch brands will increase. Satisfaction experienced by consumers during purchase is the main insurer of brand acceptance capacity. For this reason, it is hoped that XL Axiata can pay attention to the causes of consumer dissatisfied with the productsthey use tend to switch to other brands and share their negative experiences with these products. This is also supported by the statement that consumer dissatisfaction with a brand or product itself, according to Kotler and Keller cited by (Gusmadara & Utami, 2013), can encourage consumers to stop using these products and start looking for information about similar products from other brands to then switch from the previous product.

Based on this, consumers who experience dissatisfaction are likely to look for alternative brands to increase their satisfaction. Dissatisfied consumers will seek information about other product choices that add value and meet their expectations. XL axiata is expected to maximize sales by always paying attention to consumer dissatisfaction factors so that it can make consumers feel satisfied and reduce interest in switching brands to other Internet services.

4.1.2. The Effect of Seeking Variety on Interest in Switching Brands

Variety-seeking behavior can be seen as a way for consumers to satisfy their curiosity and desire to try other brands, and can also be interpreted as an attitude toward changing habits. There is an inner urge to look for or find something new that makes someone not use the same product continuously. Variety-seeking is not only driven by internal motivation, but also by boredom with a product that seems too monotonous and does not make updates or improvements to its products. Variety-seeking behavior can lead to interest in switching brands.

The results show that Seeking Variety has a positive and significant impact on brand switching interest. In the variable Seeking Variety, a significant value of 0.000 < 0.05 is obtained and the tcount value is 5.190 > 1.984. These results indicate that there is a positive and significant influence between the variable Seeking Variety on the brand switching interest of XL Internet service users. It can be concluded that hypothesis two can be accepted, that is, the need for variety has a positive and significant effect on the brand switching interest of XL Internet service users. That

is, the higher the user's need for variety, the higher the XL Internet service user's brand switching interest. Conversely, if the need for user variety is low, the brand switching interest of XL Internet service users will decrease.

This shows that research with three indicators of seeking variety, namely curiosity, desire to try new products, and boredom, can influence brand switching interest. Based on the results of this study, the average Seeking Variety experienced by XL Internet service users is in the very high category. The indicator of seeking variety that has the highest value is curiosity with a very high category, where consumers are interested in trying other brands of ISPs and feel that there are differences between superior ISPs. The second indicator is the desire to try new products with a very high category, where consumers feel that they want to try products from ISPs other than XL. The third indicator is a

sense of boredom with a high category, this result shows that many consumers are bored with XL Internet Service Providers due to various shortcomings of XL Internet Service Providers. This shows that the need for consumer variety arises because consumers have a desire to try different brands with Internet services that are superior to XL Internet services. When consumers use a product that does not meet their needs, they will feel the need for a variety of new brands, which can influence consumers' brand switching decisions.

The results of this study are consistent with research conducted by Ariani (2014) which shows that the higher the variety-seeking behavior, the higher the consumer's interest in brand switching. This is also supported by research conducted by (Dwinanto & Suasana, 2018), which shows that variety-seeking need can weaken the influence of customer satisfaction on brand switching interest. From the above research references, it can be concluded that when consumers feel the need to seek variety when using a product, the decision to switch brands will increase. When

consumers have the desire to seek variation in a product, it will result in a consumer making a brand switching decision. It is expected that XL axiata will continue to improve and issue variations to satisfy consumer desires.

According to Raju in (Uturestantix et al., 2012), a person's variation-seeking behavior is not always due to their dissatisfaction with a product, but can also be caused by a person's feelings or desire to explore in the buying behavior. Peter and Olson in (Febiastuti & Nawarini, 2018) explain that variety seeking or variety seeking is the opposite of loyalty, where there is a cognitive commitment to purchase other brands to satisfy consumer curiosity about new things or to overcome boredom with the previous brand. This is confirmed by Van Trijp in (Dianti, 2016)) who explains that variety seeking behavior can be described as a way for consumers to satisfy their curiosity and desire to try other brands, and can also be interpreted as an attitude to change habits.

Based on this, he shows that new desires or the emergence of consumer boredom with something that has been consumed for a long time will result in consumers having an interest in switching to another brand. As consumers are faced with a wide variety of products with different brands, this situation can influence consumers to try different products and brands so that consumers are not fully loyal to one product. For this reason, XL Axiata can maximize sales by always paying attention to the factors that make consumers look for variations, so that they can meet consumers' desires and reduce consumers' interest in switching brands to other Internet brands.

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1. Research Conclusion

Based on the results of the research and discussion, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- a. The results show that the consumer dissatisfaction variable has a positive and significant effect on the XL Internet service users' brand switching interest. This means that the higher the dissatisfaction of XL Internet service users, the higher the brand switching interest of XL Internet service users.
- b. The results showed that the variable Needs to Seek Variety has a positive and significant influence on the Interest in Switching Brands of XL internet service users. This means that the higher the Needs to Seek Variety of XL internet service users, the higher the Interest in Switching Brands of XL internet service users.
- c. Based on the results of the study, the theoretical and practical implications can be stated as follows, consumer dissatisfaction affects brand switching interest. Therefore, XL Axiata must pay attention to what factors make consumers feel dissatisfied with the Internet service provider because consumer dissatisfaction greatly affects consumer brand switching interest to other Internet services. According to (Tjiptono et al., 2008) that one of the specific benefits of satisfaction has a positive impact on loyalty. So there is no doubt that customer satisfaction, for the survival and competitiveness of any service provider, in an era of increasingly free competition and increasing levels of competition, satisfaction is absolute and quality is something that must receive primary attention. Consumers' need to seek variations may affect brand switching interest. Therefore, XL Axiata must pay attention to the existence of competing products and the nature of consumers' curiosity in seeking variations of these products, because consumers' need to seek new variations is very influential on consumers' brand switching interest to other Internet services. Hill in (Mayasari, 2008) says that variety- seeking behavior can occur when consumers are in a continuous state of optimal stimulation levels. This causes the perceived level of environmental stimulation to become unattractive again. Individuals who perceive this state feel the urge to search for a new stimulus. This optimal stimulus level encourages a person to seek variety. The optimal stimulus level can be explained by individuals who have a tendency to be easily open. The tendency to want to accept new things also shows that individuals avoid something monotonous, so they want to look for new variations. The results of this study are used as input for companies involved in the sale of XL Internet service providers in determining marketing strategies, factors of consumer dissatisfaction and the need to seek variations to reduce consumer interest in switching to other brands.

5.2. Research Limitations and Suggestions

This research has tried as much as possible to achieve the expected results, but there are still some limitations experienced and can be some factors that can be considered for future researchers. Some of the limitations of the study include:

- a. This study only tests the influence of two variables. For future research, it is recommended to conduct more varied tests by including several types of independent variables that are thought to have an effect.
- b. The perception and understanding of XL Internet service consumers of all the items in the research instrument and their honesty in filling out the questionnaire greatly determine the results of this study. These are both factors that researchers do not really know.

AUTHORS CONTRIBUTIONS

The three authors collectively contributed to the writing of this research article. Each author made a significant contribution to the research design, implementation, and analysis of findings, as well as to the manuscript writing.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researcher would like to express gratitude to the Dean of the Faculty of Economic and Business, the Coordinator of the Management Study Program at University of Mataram, and the fellow lecturer who provided valuable input for the findings of this research. Additionally, the researcher extends appreciation to the students of the University of Mataram Management Study Program for their contributions to this study.

REFERENCE

- Ariani, Y. P. (2014). ANALISIS FAKTOR-FAKTOR YANG MEMPENGARUHI MINAT PERPINDAHAN MEREK DENGAN REFERENCE GROUP SEBAGAI VARIABEL MODERATING (Studi kasus pada pengguna provider Indosat M3 di Kota Semarang). JURNAL SAIN PEMASARAN INDONESIA.
- Dianti, I. (2016). PENGARUH ATRIBUT PRODUK, HARGA, VARIETY SEEKING DAN KETIDAKPUASAN KONSUMEN TERHADAP KEPUTUSAN PERPINDAHAN MEREK SMARTPHONE DI MATARAM. Jurnal Sangkareang Mataram, 2(3). http://www.untb.ac.id
- Dwinanto, R. R., & Suasana, I. Gst. A. Kt. Gd. (2018). KEBUTUHAN MENCARI VARIASI MEMODERASI PENGARUH KEPUASAN PELANGGAN SMARTPHONE SAMSUNG TERHADAP NIAT BERPINDAH MEREK DI DENPASAR. E-Jurnal Manajemen Unud, 7. https://doi.org/10.24843/EJMUNUD.2018.v7.i11.p12
- Febiastuti, S., & Nawarini, A. T. (2018). Factors Influencing Brand Switching Behavior: Role Of Variety Seeking Need As Moderator Variable. Journal of Research in Management, 1(2). http://irsmanagementstudies.com/index.php/irs
- Klaudea, B., & Rohman, F. (2022). PENGARUH KETIDAKPUASAAN KONSUMEN DAN PENCARIAN VARIASI TERHADAP MINAT BERPINDAH MEREK. JURNAL PEMASARAN DAN PERILAKU KONSUMEN . https://doi.org/10.21776/jmppk.2022.01.4.10
- Mayasari, I. (2008). Perilaku Pencarian Variasi: Ditinjau dari Perspektif Psikologi dan Imbasnya Pada
- Loyalitas Kesikapan Konsumen. Jurnal Manajemen Teori Dan Terapan, 56-70.
- Pratama, K. R., & Pratomo, Y. (n.d.). XL dan Axis Dilaporkan Gangguan Hari Ini, Sinyal Hilang serta "Tidak Ada Layanan." Kompas.Com. Retrieved July 22, 2023, from https://tekno.kompas.com/read/2022/07/07/17073617/xl-dan-axis-dilaporkan-gangguan-hari-inihilang-serta-tidak-ada-layanan?page=2
- Uturestantix, Warokka, A., & Gallato, C. G. (2012). Do Customer Dissatisfaction and Variety Seeking Really Affect the Product Brand Switching? A Lesson from the Biggest Southeast Asia Mobile Telecommunication Market. https://api.semanticscholar.org/CorpusID:31589
- Wardhaniika, N. I. K., & Hendrati, I. M. (2021). PERPINDAHAN MEREK AKIBAT KETIDAKPUASAN KONSUMEN DALAM PEMILIHAN PRODUK SMARTPHONE. IDEI: Jurnal Ekonomi & Bisnis, 2(1), 21– 30. https://doi.org/10.38076/ideijeb.v2i1.56